UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

| APPLICATION NO. | FILING DATE | FIRST NAMED INVENTOR | ATTORNEY DOCKET NO. | CONFIRMATION NO. |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 10/698,610 | 10/31/2003 | Marc Gandar | M2006-700010 | 9895 |

37462        7590        05/22/2008
LOWRIE, LANDO & ANASTASI, LLP
ONE MAIN STREET, SUITE 1100
CAMBRIDGE, MA 02142

| EXAMINER |
|---|
| TIV, BACKHEAN |

| ART UNIT | PAPER NUMBER |
|---|---|
| 2151 | |

| NOTIFICATION DATE | DELIVERY MODE |
|---|---|
| 05/22/2008 | ELECTRONIC |

**Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.**

The time period for reply, if any, is set in the attached communication.

Notice of the Office communication was sent electronically on above-indicated "Notification Date" to the following e-mail address(es):

docketing@ll-a.com
gengelson@ll-a.com

### *Response to Arguments*

Applicant's arguments filed 4/10/08 have been fully considered but they are not persuasive.

The applicant argues in substance,

a) the final Office Action was improper,

b) Motivation to combine,

c) Saito does not teach, "each device of the plurality of devices comprise a communication circuit connected to a processing unit and comprising a plurality of addresses", and "each address is associated with one of a transmission indicator or reception indicator, wherein each address is associated with a memory containing an information frame that can be at least one of modified and read by the processing unit",

d) Saito does not teach, "a master device periodically transmits an address of the plurality of addresses",

e) Osakabe does not teach having "the communication circuit of the device for which the address transmitted by the master device is associated the transmission indicator transmit the information frame contained in the memory associated with the address and provide its processing unit with an identifier of the address",

f) Osakabe does not teach, "having the communication circuit of each device for which the address transmitted by the master device is associated with the reception indicator write into the memory associated with the address of the information frame and provide its processing unit with an identifier of the address".

g) Osakabe does not teach, " a direction table".

*In reply to a);* The applicant has argued that the Final Office Action was improper because the applicant made only minor amendments to overcome claim objections given in the Non-Final Action, 7/3/07. In the Non-Final Action, the Office advised the applicant to amend the claims to take out the representation of each element. The objection did not advise the applicant to amend claims include, "wherein only a single device of the plurality of devices includes one of the plurality of addresses associated with the transmission indicator", "having a master device periodically transmit an address of the plurality of addresses and responsive to transmission of the address by the master device", nor "a direction table" these are substantive changes to the claims.

Therefore, as set forth in MPEP 706.07(a), the Final Office Action is deemed proper.

*In reply to b);* In response to applicant's argument that there is no suggestion to combine the references, the examiner recognizes that obviousness can only be established by combining or modifying the teachings of the prior art to produce the claimed invention where there is some teaching, suggestion, or motivation to do so found either in the references themselves or in the knowledge generally available to one of ordinary skill in the art. See *In re Fine*, 837 F.2d 1071, 5 USPQ2d 1596 (Fed. Cir. 1988)and *In re Jones*, 958 F.2d 347, 21 USPQ2d 1941 (Fed. Cir. 1992). In this case Osakabe, col.1, lines 5-15, provides motivation to combine of controlling devices using a bi-directional system, e.g.Bluetooth.

***In reply to c);*** Saito, para.0118-0121, Fig.14, teaches that Echonet device A has a Destination IP Address, Transmitting IP Address, and teaches Echonet device A can broadcast using IPv4, multicast IPv6, broadcast in Bluetooth, or broadcast in PAN, therefore Saito does teach, "each device of the plurality of devices comprises a communication circuit connected to a processing unit and comprising a plurality of addresses" and "each address is associated with one of a transmission indicator or reception indicator, wherein each address is associated with a memory containing an information frame that can be at least one of modified and read by the processing unit".

***In reply to d);*** Saito, para.0063-0072, teaches the Echonet controller can assign each Echonet device a different address, therefore, teaches "a master device periodically transmits an address of the plurality of addresses".

***In reply to e);*** Osakabe, Figs.1-11, col.2, lines 20-65, teaches that frames are sent from a master device with information, e.g. Master address, slave address, master address bit, slave address bit, control bits, data field, and further teaches certain codes corresponds to certain functions which includes read/writing functions in memory for addresses therefore teaches "the communication circuit of the device for which the address transmitted by the master device is associated the transmission indicator transmit the information frame contained in the memory associated with the address and provide its processing unit with an identifier of the address".

***In reply to f);*** Osakabe, Figs. 1-11, col.9, lines 5-col.10, line 65, teaches that master device sending an address to a slave device which contains certain codes to read/write functions to memory therefore teaches, "having the communication circuit of

each device for which the address transmitted by the master device is associated with

the reception indicator write into the memory associated with the address of the

information frame and provide its processing unit with an identifier of the address".

*In reply to g);* Osakabe, Fig.3, clearly teaches a direction table, the direction of

the message, e.g.from slave to master or from master to slave, therefore teaches "a

direction table".